

THOMAS G. SHERWOOD JAMES P. TRUITT III

AMY E. ABBANDONDELO ROBYN M. FEARON 300 GARDEN CITY PLAZA, SUITE 222 GARDEN CITY, NEW YORK 11530 T (516)408-7030 F (516)408-7032 TGSHERWOOD@TGSHERWOOD.COM

June 1, 2018

#### VIA ECF

Hon. Lois Bloom United States District Court Eastern District of New York 225 Cadman Plaza East Brooklyn, New York 11201

Re:

Desir v. Florida Capital Bank, N.A., et al.

Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-LB

Dear Magistrate Judge:

We represent Defendant Stewart Title Company, Inc. ("STC"), incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title. We write in response to Plaintiff's request for a certificate of default against STC (Docket No. 15), which was filed on May 30, 2018, the day after STC timely served and filed its answer to the Plaintiff's complaint (Docket No. 8), notice of appearance (Docket No. 9), and corporate disclosure statement (Docket No. 10) (see also Docket No, 26, confirming that STC's deadline to appear or answer with respect to Plaintiff's complaint was May 29, 2018).

As the certificates of service attached to STC's answer, notice of appearance, and corporate disclosure statement show, Stewart timely answered Plaintiff's complaint and is not in default. Upon our receipt of Plaintiff's request for a certificate of default, we provided Plaintiff with proof of STC's timely appearance, and requested that Plaintiff immediately withdraw her request (see email with attachments enclosed). Plaintiff failed to respond or withdraw her application.

To the extent this Court is inclined to entertain Plaintiff's request for a certificate of default against STC, then STC respectfully requests a briefing schedule to oppose Plaintiff's application.

Respectfully submitted,

s\ Amy E. Abbandondelo

#### **Enclosures**

cc: Carlyne Desir (via email and regular mail)

Mitchell L. Pashkin, Esq. (via ECF)
Ashley Miller, Esq. (via ECF)
Evan E. Damico, Esq. (via ECF)
BJ Phoenix Finneran, Esq. (via ECF)

#### Amy E. Abbandondelo

From: Amy E. Abbandondelo

**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2018 12:57 PM

To: 'carlynedesir@gmail.com'

Cc: 'ashley.miller@akerman.com'; James P. Truit III; 'edamico@winston.com';

'bifinneran@zeklaw.com'

Subject: Desir v. Florida Capital Bank, N.A., et al. (Case No. 18-CV-02630)

Attachments: Filed answer with certificate of service.pdf; Filed notice of appearance with certificate of

service.pdf; Filed disclosure statement with certificate of service.pdf

Dear Ms. Desir:

We represent Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc. ("STC"), incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title, in the above-referenced action. On May 29, 2018, we served STC's answer to the complaint, notice of appearance, and rule 7.1 disclosure statement by regular mail upon all parties and electronically filed those documents with the court (see copies of STC's filed answer, notice of appearance, and disclosure statement with certificates of service).

Today we received notification electronically of your request to hold STC in default. As established by the attached certificates of service, STC timely appeared and answered the complaint. Accordingly, we request that you immediately withdraw your application to hold STC in default.

All rights reserved.

Very truly yours,

Amy E. Abbandondelo
THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC
300 Garden City Plaza, Suite 222
Garden City, New York 11530
T: (516) 408-7030
F: (516) 408-7032
aabbandondelo@tgsherwood.com
http://www.tgsherwood.com/

CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT: The information contained in the e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential, and are intended only for the use of the individual or entity to whom this e-mail is addressed. This communication may contain material protected by the attorney-client privilege. If you are not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering this e-mail to the intended recipient, then you have received this communication in error and any review, dissemination, forwarding, printing, copying, or other use of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by telephone at (516) 408-7030.

IRS CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE: This firm does not give tax advice. Nevertheless, to the extent that this e-mail can be construed as containing any tax advice, it was not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used by you or any taxpayer, (i) to avoid any penalties imposed under the Internal Revenue Code or (ii) to promote, market, or recommend to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
----X
CARLYNE DESIR,

Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JO

Plaintiff,

٧.

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

Defendants.	
	X

# ANSWER TO COMPLAINT

Defendant STEWART TITLE COMPANY INC. ("STC"), incorrectly named herein as STEWART TITLE, by its undersigned counsel, THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC, for its answer to the complaint (the "Complaint") of Plaintiff Carlyne Desir ("Plaintiff"), alleges as follows upon information and belief:

1. Denies the allegations set forth in each and every paragraph of the Complaint, except admits the allegations set forth in numbered paragraph 6 on page 3 of the Complaint (second paragraph from the top of page 3 of the Complaint).

## FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

2. This Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction over this case.

## SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

- 3. Plaintiff's claims all appear to arise from Plaintiff's purchase of real property located at 1192 East 46th Street, Brooklyn, New York 11234 (the "Property") on or about June 22, 2006, nearly twelve years ago.
- 4. Accordingly, Plaintiff's claims against Stewart are barred, in whole or in part, by the applicable statutes of limitations.

#### THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

5. STC did not owe any duty of care to Plaintiff in connection with the allegations set forth in the Complaint and, accordingly, STC is not liable to Plaintiff.

# FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

- 6. Plaintiff did not purchase a title insurance policy (the "Alleged Policy") underwritten by STC relating to 1192 East 46th Street, Brooklyn, New York 11234 (the "Property").
- 7. STC is not the addressee or a recipient of the undated letter annexed as Exhibit F to the Complaint from Plaintiff purportedly submitting a claim under the Alleged Policy.

- 8. STC did not perform any services relating to the disputed transaction and had no involvement whatsoever with the disputed transaction.
- 9. Plaintiff had no contractual relationship with STC and was not in privity with STC in connection with the events alleged in the Complaint.
- 10. Accordingly, STC cannot be liable to Plaintiff by reason of the allegations set forth in the Complaint.

## FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

11. Any alleged injuries and/or damages that Plaintiff sustained were not proximately caused by any act or omission by STC or anyone authorized to act on STC's behalf.

#### SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

12. The Complaint fails to plead a claim for fraud against STC with the specificity and particularity required under the FRCP.

# SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

13. The relief requested in the Complaint is barred by the doctrine of laches, as a result of Plaintiff's inordinate delay in bringing this action.

# EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

14. Plaintiff has failed to mitigate any alleged damages.

### NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

15. Plaintiff's claims against STC are barred by the doctrines of waiver, estoppel, and ratification.

### TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

16. The injuries and/or damages alleged to have been sustained by Plaintiff were caused entirely or in part by the culpable conduct of Plaintiff, other defendants, or nonparties, without any negligence on the part of STC, and STC seeks a dismissal of the Complaint or a reduction in any recovery that may be had by Plaintiff in the proportion that the culpable conduct attributed to such others bears to the entire measure of responsibility for the occurrence.

## ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

17. To the extent (if any) that Plaintiff seeks damages from STC arising from an alleged breach of the Alleged Policy, Plaintiff's claims are barred by one or more exclusions from coverage, exceptions from coverage, conditions, or stipulations set forth in the Alleged Policy.

## TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

18. Under the terms of the Alleged Policy, any liability that STC might otherwise have to Plaintiff in negligence merged into the Alleged Policy.

The Complaint fails to comply with FRCP Rules 8, 9, and 11, is incoherent, and frivolous. STC reserves its rights to assert additional affirmative defenses and claims once Plaintiff provides adequate notice of the transactions and occurrences that allegedly gave rise to this action and the legal basis for Plaintiff's claims.

WHEREFORE, STC respectfully demands judgment dismissing the Complaint as against it with prejudice, together with such other and further relief as to this Court may seem just and proper.

Date: May 29, 2018

THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC

By

Amy E. Abbandondelo Attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc. incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title 300 Garden City Plaza, Suite 222 Garden City, NY 11530

T: (516) 408-7030 F: (516) 408-7032

aabbandondelo@tgsherwood.com

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
CARLYNE DESIR,	~

Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JO

Plaintiff,

٧.

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

	Defendants.
	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
STATE OF NEW YORK	)
COUNTY OF NASSAU	: ss.:

AMY E. ABBANDONDELO, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

- 1. I am over eighteen years of age and I am associated with Thomas G. Sherwood, LLC, attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc., incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title, in this action. I am not a party to this action.
- 2. On the 29<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2018, I served copies of the foregoing Answer to Complaint, upon the parties named below, via first class mail, by depositing true copies thereof, properly enclosed in sealed, post-paid wrappers, in a letter box in the County of Nassau and State of New York, a depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service, directed to said parties as follows:

Carlyne Desir 1211 Atlantic Court Kissimmee, Florida 34759 Florida Capital Bank, N.A. 10151 Deerwood Park Boulevard Building 100, Suite 200-A Jacksonville, Florida 32256

The Bank of New York Mellon f/k/a
The Bank New York, (CWALT 2006-31CB)
225 Liberty Street
New York, New York 10286

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP Attention: Evan E. D'Amico, Esq. 200 Park Avenue New York, New York 10166

Bayview Loan Servicing, LLC Corporation Service Company 1201 Hays Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Frenkel Lambert Weiss Weisman & Gordon, LLP 20 West Main Street Bayshore, New York 11706

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. 270 Park Avenue New York, New York 10017

Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Inc. (MERS)

1818 Library Street, Suite 300

Reston, Virginia 20190

AMYE, ABBANDONDELO

Sworn to before me this 2/day of May, 2018

**Notary Public** 

LORI GAETANI
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 01GA6080119
Qualified in Nassau County
Commission Expires 9/09/20

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
X	
CARLYNE DESIR,	
	Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JO

Plaintiff,

v.

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

Defendants.	
,	X

## NOTICE OF APPEARANCE

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC hereby appears in this action as attorneys for Defendant STEWART TITLE COMPANY INC., incorrectly named herein as STEWART TITLE, and that the undersigned attorney is admitted or otherwise authorized to practice in this Court;

# PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that THOMAS G. SHERWOOD,

LLC hereby demands that all notices and papers be served upon it at its offices located at 300 Garden City Plaza, Suite 222, Garden City, New York 11530.

Date: May 29, 2018

THOMAS G. SHEKWOOD, LLC

Amy E. Abbandondelo

Attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc. incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title 300 Garden City Plaza, Suite 222 Garden City, NY 11530

T: (516) 408-7030 F: (516) 408-7032

aabbandondelo@tgsherwood.com

Case 1:18-cv-02630-ENV-JO Document 9-1 Filed 05/29/18 Page 1 of 2 Page D#: 102

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
***************************************	X
CARLYNE DESIR,	

Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JO

Plaintiff,

v.

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

	X
	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
STATE OF NEW YORK )	

: ss.:

Defendants.

COUNTY OF NASSAU )

AMY E. ABBANDONDELO, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

- 1. I am over eighteen years of age and I am associated with Thomas G. Sherwood, LLC, attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc., incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title, in this action. I am not a party to this action.
- 2. On the 29<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2018, I served copies of the foregoing Notice of Appearance, upon the parties named below, via first class mail, by depositing true copies thereof, properly enclosed in sealed, post-paid wrappers, in a letter box in the County of Nassau and State of New York, a depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service, directed to said parties as follows:

Carlyne Desir 1211 Atlantic Court Kissimmee, Florida 34759 Florida Capital Bank, N.A. 10151 Deerwood Park Boulevard Building 100, Suite 200-A Jacksonville, Florida 32256

The Bank of New York Mellon f/k/a
The Bank New York, (CWALT 2006-31CB)
225 Liberty Street
New York, New York 10286

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP Attention: Evan E. D'Amico, Esq. 200 Park Avenue New York, New York 10166

Bayview Loan Servicing, LLC Corporation Service Company 1201 Hays Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Frenkel Lambert Weiss Weisman & Gordon, LLP 20 West Main Street Bayshore, New York 11706

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. 270 Park Avenue New York, New York 10017

Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Inc. (MERS)

1818 Library Street, Suite 300

Reston, Virginia 20190

AMYE, ABBANDONDELO

Sworn to before me this 29<sup>th</sup>day of May, 2018

**Notary Public** 

LORI GAETANI
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 01GA6080119
Qualified in Nassau County
Commission Expires 9/09/20

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
мымининимининимининими же	
CARLYNE DESIR,	
,	Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JO

Plaintiff,

v.

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

Defendants.	
	7

# **RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Defendant STEWART TITLE COMPANY INC. ("STC"), incorrectly named herein as STEWART TITLE, by its undersigned counsel. THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC, provides the following statement under Rule 7.1 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure:

STC is a wholly owned subsidiary of Stewart Title Guaranty Company, which is in turn a wholly owned subsidiary of Stewart Information Services Corp. No other entity, directly or indirectly, owns 10% or more of any class of STC's equity interests.

Date: May 29, 2018

THOMAS G. SHERWOOD, LLC

Amy E. Abbandondelo

Attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc. incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title 300 Garden City Plaza, Suite 222

Garden City, NY 11530 T: (516) 408-7030

F: (516) 408-7032

aabbandondelo@tgsherwood.com

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	V	
CARLYNE DESIR,	X	G N 10 GW 02620 END/ IG
Plaintiff,	,	Case No. 18-CV-02630-ENV-JC

FLORIDA CAPITAL BANK, N.A., THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON FKA THE BANK OF NEW YORK (CWALT 2006-31 CB), BANK OF AMERICA, BAYVIEW LOAN SERVICING, LLC, FRENKEL LAMBERT WEISS WEISMAN & GORDON, LLP, STEWART TITLE, JP MORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A., and MORTGAGE ELECTRONIC

REGISTRATION SYSTEMS, INC. (MERS),

v.

Defendants.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

STATE OF NEW YORK )
: ss.:

COUNTY OF NASSAU )

AMY E. ABBANDONDELO, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

- 1. I am over eighteen years of age and I am associated with Thomas G. Sherwood, LLC, attorneys for Defendant Stewart Title Company Inc., incorrectly named herein as Stewart Title, in this action. I am not a party to this action.
- 2. On the 29<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2018, I served copies of the foregoing Rule 7.1 Disclosure Statement, upon the parties named below, via first class mail, by depositing true copies thereof, properly enclosed in sealed, post-paid wrappers, in a letter box in the County of Nassau and State of New York, a depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service, directed to said parties as follows:

Carlyne Desir 1211 Atlantic Court Kissimmee, Florida 34759 Florida Capital Bank, N.A. 10151 Deerwood Park Boulevard Building 100, Suite 200-A Jacksonville, Florida 32256

The Bank of New York Mellon f/k/a
The Bank New York, (CWALT 2006-31CB)
225 Liberty Street
New York, New York 10286

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP Attention: Evan E. D'Amico, Esq. 200 Park Avenue New York, New York 10166

Bayview Loan Servicing, LLC Corporation Service Company 1201 Hays Street Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Frenkel Lambert Weiss Weisman & Gordon, LLP 20 West Main Street Bayshore, New York 11706

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. 270 Park Avenue New York, New York 10017

Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Inc. (MERS) 1818 Library Street, Suite 300

Reston, Virginia 20190

AMY E. ABBANDONDELO

Sworn to before me this 2018

Notary Public

LORI GAETANI
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 01GA6080119
Qualified in Nassau County
Commission Expires 9/09/20

### Amy E. Abbandondelo

From: ecf\_bounces@nyed.uscourts.gov

**Sent:** Thursday, May 31, 2018 1:56 PM **To:** nobody@nyed.uscourts.gov

Subject: Activity in Case 1:18-cv-02630-ENV-JO Desir v. Florida Capital Bank, N.A. et al Summons

Returned Executed

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

\*\*\*NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS\*\*\* Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing. However, if the referenced document is a transcript, the free copy and 30 page limit do not apply.

#### **U.S. District Court**

#### **Eastern District of New York**

## **Notice of Electronic Filing**

The following transaction was entered on 5/31/2018 at 1:56 PM EDT and filed on 5/25/2018

Case Name:

Desir v. Florida Capital Bank, N.A. et al

**Case Number:** 

1:18-cv-02630-ENV-JO

Filer:

Carlyne Desir

**Document Number: 26** 

#### **Docket Text:**

SUMMONS Returned Executed by Carlyne Desir. Stewart Title CT Corporation System served on 5/8/2018, answer due 5/29/2018. (Galeano, Sonia)

#### 1:18-cv-02630-ENV-JO Notice has been electronically mailed to:

BJ Phoenix Finneran bjfinneran@zeklaw.com, bjfinneran@verizon.net

Ashley Sparrow Miller ashley.miller@akerman.com, ashleysparrowmiller@gmail.com

Amy Elizabeth Abbandondelo aabbandondelo@tgsherwood.com

Evan E. Damico edamico@winston.com, docketny@winston.com, evan-damico-2783@ecf.pacerpro.com, mpolster@winston.com

#### 1:18-cv-02630-ENV-JO Notice will not be electronically mailed to:

Carlyne Desir 1211 Atlantic Court Kissimmee, FL 34759

# 

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

**Document description:** Main Document **Original filename:** n/a

**Electronic document Stamp:** 

[STAMP NYEDStamp\_ID=875559751 [Date=5/31/2018] [FileNumber=12881930-0] [525c6eddc470f4cb35ae5ed66f3562c28a723eb8eba5ceacd002befa0372e42cabd3 dcc8782dbe8a916d0747c0e1663879207ff85075b8445de928b14b31171c]]